

The prosecution appointed by the Great Lakes/Gulf Presbytery (RPCNA) charges Mr. David Carr with the sin of exercising ordained church leadership contrary to God's moral law by:

- 1) Participating in the toleration of conflicts of interest within the Immanuel RP Church session, which failed to safeguard his and the session's reputation and ministerial qualifications to be above reproach. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 9th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4 & #6)
- 2) Allowing the undue influence of Mr. Olivetti in discussions, direction, and decisions relating to the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church, which proved prejudicial to the interests of victims and the overall safety and chastity of God's people. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 7th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4 & #6)
- 3) Failing to handle the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church with appropriate care and urgency, thereby neglecting his duty to protect and provide for Christ's sheep in soul and body and preserve their chastity. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 7th Comm., 9th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4, Ordination Query #8)
- 4) Participating in a series of partial or misleading communications related to the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church, which fostered distrust and disunity within the body of Christ, thereby failing to promote the purity, peace, unity, and progress of the church. (3rd Comm., 9th Comm., Ordination Query #8)

See circumstances of offense (time & place) annexed to the charges below, with a list of witnesses and the body evidence. Prosecution reserves the right to include additional circumstances of offense as applicable, within the rules of discovery (BoD II.2.3, E-11).

Respectfully submitted,

Shawn Anderson
Jason Camery
Josh Reshey

The prosecution appointed by the Great Lakes/Gulf Presbytery (RPCNA) charges Mr. David Carr with the sin of exercising ordained church leadership contrary to God’s moral law by:

1) Participating in the toleration of conflicts of interest within the Immanuel RP Church session, which failed to safeguard his and the session’s reputation and ministerial qualifications to be above reproach. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 9th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4 & #6)

Circumstances of Offense:

1. *On Jul 26, 2020, Mr. Carr acted as the AIC to give the IRPC session, permission to select their own advisory committee.*

Evidence #1: AIC Minutes (Jul 26, 2020)

Evidence #2: Letter to the congregation from IRPC Session (Sept 6, 2020)

Evidence #3: Email of the AIC Minutes and actions (Sept 7, 2020)

2. *Mr. Carr did not ensure that Jared Olivetti was fully recused from the discussions and decisions of the case of abuse.*

Evidence #1: Joint Slack Channel (ex. June 13, July 30, Sept 6, Oct 14, 23, Nov 4, Dec 18, 19, 23)

Evidence #2: Minutes of AIC (Jul 26, 2020)

3. *Mr. Carr gave the impression in the public record that Mr. Olivetti was recused.*

Evidence #1: Timeline of Investigation for Commission (IRPC Session Docs for Commission)

Evidence #2: IRPC Advisory Committee report to the Presbytery Commission (Jan 15, 2021)

Evidence #3: Letter from Olivetti’s to IRPC elders (Sept 3, 2020)

Evidence #4: IRPC Session Docs for Commission, “Introduction” (Jan 21, 2021)

Evidence #5: IRPC Minutes of Session (Sept 18, 2020)

Evidence #6: AIC Minutes (Sept 19, 2020)

Evidence #7: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

Evidence #8: IRPC Minutes of Session (Jan 1, 2021)

[REDACTED]

4. *Mr. Carr did not ensure that [REDACTED] were fully recused from the discussions and decisions of the case of abuse after Aug 29, 2020.*

Evidence #1: IRPC Session Docs for Commission

Evidence #2: IRPC Session Minutes

2) Allowing the undue influence of Mr. Olivetti in discussions, direction, and decisions relating to the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church, which proved prejudicial to the interests of victims and the overall safety and chastity of God’s people. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 7th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4 & #6)

Circumstances of Offense:

1. *By Sept 3, 2020, Mr. Carr allowed Mr. Olivetti, who had a conflict of interest in this matter, to propose a different path in the direction of this case, which the session implemented, including the halting of an immediate leave of absence for Mr. Olivetti.*

Evidence #1: The counsel of the Advisory Committee (Aug 29, 2020)

Evidence #2: The IRPC session's letter to Mr. Olivetti (Sept 2, 2020)

Evidence #3: Mr. Olivetti's response to the IRPC session (Sept 3, 2020)

Evidence #4: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

2. *Mr. Carr allowed Mr. Olivetti to inform the youth group leaders of the offender's identity to solicit the leaders' commitment to supervise the offender at all youth group functions.*

Evidence #1: The counsel of the Advisory Committee (Aug 29, 2020)

Evidence #2: Ruling Elders Slack Channel (Sept 8,9 & 11)

██

3) Failing to handle the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church with appropriate care and urgency, thereby neglecting his duty to protect and provide for Christ's sheep in soul and body and preserve their chastity. (5th Comm., 6th Comm., 7th Comm., 9th Comm., Covenant of Communicant Membership #4, Ord. Query #8)

Circumstances of Offense:

1. *Mr. Carr failed to inform the congregation of the nature of the abuse that took place, the timeline, the location in an appropriate amount of time between Apr 23 and Sept 6, 2020.*

Evidence #1: IRPC Session Docs for Commission, "Introduction" (Jan 21, 2021)

Evidence #2: Judicial Commission meeting with IRPC elders (Feb 27, 2021)

Evidence #3: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

Evidence #4: The IRPC session letter to the congregation (Sept 6, 2020)

██

Evidence #6: Safety Plan for the Offender's participation in church activities (Dec 19, 2020)

██

Evidence #8: Advisory Committee's "Letter to Session" (Nov 4, 2020)

Evidence #9: Ruling Elder Slack Channel (Nov 10, 2020)

2. *From the time that he was made aware on August 10, 2020, Mr. Carr failed to notify ██████████ of the incidents of molestation that had taken place by the offender against their child.*

Evidence #1: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

Evidence #2: Nate Pfeiffer's report to the Immanuel RPC session (Aug 10, 2020)

Evidence #3: Communication between Offender and Victim (Apr 18, 2020)

Evidence #4: Immanuel Child Protection Policy (approved Mar 3, 2020)

Evidence #5: Ruling Elders Slack Channel (Dec 21, 2020)

3. *Mr. Carr authorized the offender, who had not completed [REDACTED] therapy or counseling, to attend and participate in the youth group without informing youth group parents.*

Evidence #1: Ruling Elders Slack Channel (Sept 11, 2020)

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Evidence #7: Safety Plan for the Offender's participation in youth group (Sept 25, 2020)

4. *Mr. Carr was negligent in meeting and ministering to [REDACTED] from Aug 29, 2020 to Jan 12, 2021.*

Evidence #1: [REDACTED] email to IRPC session (Dec 20, 2020)

Evidence #2: [REDACTED] letter to the Judicial Commission (Jan 12, 2021)

5. *Mr. Carr was negligent in meeting and ministering to [REDACTED] from Apr 23 to Dec 3, 2020. This was despite [REDACTED] sharing their sense of neglect by the ruling elders, asking for contact twice via email.*

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

6. *Mr. Carr did not consistently supervise the children as he promised to plan and perform on October 18 & 24. Mr. Carr never informed the congregation that they over-committed to supervise the youth in the fellowship hall and in the basement.*

Evidence #1: Session's Second Letter to IRPC Congregation (Oct 18, 2020)

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Evidence #5: Advisory Committee Letter to IRPC Session re: safety plan (Nov 4, 2020)

Evidence #6: Josh Bright's resignation letter (Dec 18, 2020)

Evidence #7: RE, Zachary Blackwood's Letter of Confession (Mar 5, 2020)

7. *Mr. Carr failed to maintain all the steps laid out in IRPC's child protection policy.*

Evidence #1: Immanuel Child Protection Policy (approved Mar 3, 2020)

[REDACTED]

4) Participating in a series of partial or misleading communications related to the sexual abuse case at the Immanuel RP Church, which fostered distrust and disunity within the body of Christ, thereby failing to promote the purity, peace, unity, and progress of the church. (3rd Comm., 9th Comm., Ordination Query #8)

Circumstances of Offense

1. *Mr. Carr allowed Josh Greiner to understand that the IRPC session asked the Presbytery to get involved.*

Evidence #1: Letter from Faith to IRPC Elders (Jul 24, 2020)

Evidence #2: Joint Slack Channel (Jul 30, 2020)

Evidence #3: Email from Josh Greiner to Commission, "Immanuel RPCNA" (Jan 11, 2021)

2. *Mr. Carr gave the impression that Presbytery was serving as a source of oversight and accountability to the IRPC session's decisions and direction in this case.*

Evidence #1: AIC Minutes (Jul 26, 2020)

Evidence #2: Letter to the congregation from IRPC Session (Sept 6, 2020)

Evidence #3: Email of the AIC Minutes and actions (Sept 7, 2020)

3. *On Jan 2, 2021, at a church family meeting at IRPC, Mr. Carr made a false statement that Josh Bright did not give any reasons for his resignation from the diaconate. He later apologized to the congregation by email on Jan 12, 2021.*

Evidence #1: Josh Bright's resignation letter (Dec 18, 2020)

Evidence #2: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

Evidence #3: David Carr's email to the congregation (Jan 12, 2021)

[REDACTED]

4. *Mr. Carr informed the parents of the Immanuel RP Church of the sexual abuse case but did not inform the youth group parents, who must equally weigh the risks involved and watchfulness required.*

Evidence #1: Letter to the congregation from IRPC Session (Sept 6, 2020)

[REDACTED]

Evidence #3: Safety Plan for the Offender's participation in youth group (Sept 25, 2020)

5. *Mr. Carr had the youth group leaders informed but not the youth group parents who have the primary responsibility to oversee and ensure their child's safety.*

Evidence #1: Ruling Elders Slack Channel (Sept 11, 2020)

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

6. *Mr. Carr did not include [REDACTED] as a victim family in report to IRPC.*

Evidence #1: Immanuel Church Family Meeting (Jan 2, 2021)

Evidence #2: Ruling Elders Slack Channel (Sept 11, 2020)